Minutes of the Air Quality Task Force Meeting Imperial / Mexicali February 8th, 2018 UABC Mexicali

Co-chairs: Reyes Romero; Margarito Quintero

I. Attendance:

Reyes Romero; Imperial Valley Air Pollution Control District; Margarito Quintero, SPA; Belen Leon, Imperial Valley Air Pollution Control District; Fernando Flores, OBSERBC; Gabriela Ruiz Reyes, OBSERBC; Alejandra Alvarez Carrillo, OBSERBC; Ray Askins, environmentalist; Jeremy Bauer, USEPA; Temoc Avila, researcher; Dzoara Tejeda Honstein, LT Consulting; Mauro Alvarado Castillo, TL Consulting; Fernando Amador, CARB; Raul Tovar, SPA; Miriam Lopez, LT Consulting; Carlos Romero, LT Consulting; Luis Flores Solis, DPA;

II. Welcome and Initial Comments

Reyes Romero y Margarito Quintero welcomed everybody and thanked them for attending the meeting.

III. Revision of Minutes from Prior Meeting

Reyes Romero said it was the time to make any comments or suggestions regarding the prior minutes. Since there were no comments at this time, the minutes were approved.

IV. Presentations / Questions and Answers

"State PROAIRE"; M.C. Dzoara Tejeda Honstein, LT Consulting, Environmental Firm

Fernando Amador said measure 5 was not clear for him, and asked if she could further explain it to him. He also asked for a copy of the presentation.

Dzoada Tejeda explained that this measure was related to the overall sustainable mobility plans. She explained that its purpose was to improve mobility in the main cities avoiding traffic jams, and thus preventing idling vehicles, which raise emissions. She added that this measure also includes giving alternatives to the citizenship to be able to mobilize by bicycle or walking through restructuring roadways.

An Attendee asked if the consulting Group was aware of the fact that on January 11th, 2013 the state government had published on the official journal, the establishment of the Baja California Environmental Defense Agency, which would be the agency in charge of fighting against the Environmental Protection Secretariat. On the other hand, since methane gas from livestock is the main precursor for ozone, he said he would like her to further explain measure 12, which addresses actions against livestock pollution. He asked if the consulting group had a copy of the analysis done by the Technological University of Vienna, on which it is shown that only 5% of the total anthropogenic environmental pollution, which corresponds to 3% of the world's total carbon dioxide pollution, and at the same time proves that automobiles only pollute 0.175%. Lastly, he asked who the consulting group was made up of.

Dzoada Tejeda said the consulting Group, which she represented was made up of more than 10 people from different parts of the country, and specialized on different areas. She mentioned they have personnel with background on environmental chemical engineering as well as people with post graduate studies and doctorates. She also said that most of the consulting group is part of a private non-governmental consulting Company. She said they come from the research area, and that most of them were based out of Monterrey, Nuevo Leon, and México City, where SEMARNAT offices are located. She added that the managing of the PROAIRES was done by

SEMARNAT together with the state, and that it was about 3 or 4 years ago when it was decided to include participation of a private consulting company to help them achieving their goals. She said that the analysis, the diagnostic figures as well as the measures are defined together with the involved parties and are not defined by the consultor. She also added that the consulting group presents them with evidence and tools so that areas of opportunity can be identified. She explained that decisions are made by community representatives from government and civil society for whom they are working for. She said their task was to serve as a guide in order to establish the relevant measures following a methodology developed in part by SEMARNAT 3 years ago. With regards to the Environmental Defense Agency, she said the consulting group had gone over all of the legislative part, and she mentioned that under measure 1 of the regulation, what pertains to the agency appears as an action. She said she was not familiar with the study made by the Technological University of Vienna. However, she mentioned that livestock emissions, which produce methane are included under a measure called Formulation of a Program to Control Air Emissions from Livestock Activities and invited him to read the document.

The same attendee pointed out that the Imperial Valley had already taken livestock from urban zones, while Mexicali had 130 thousand head of livestock 6 kilometers from the city. He said that was the reason why he was interested on which measures were being proposed to face this situation.

Dzoada Tejeda said that as she had already mentioned, it was not about what they propose, it was about what had been agreed upon at the meetings where the results were presented showing that livestock represented an issue in Mexicali as well as in Tecate. However, she said that the measures and all of their details were included on a 200 page document about to be signed already as an agreement.

Fernando Amador said he was surprised that there was very little or almost no mention of heavy duty diesel vehicles and asked if it was due to a lack of data or if it was because they were an insignificant part of the emissions.

Mauro Alvarado Castillo said that they were indeed included, but that they do not appear as main numbers.

Ray Askins said he would like to see a statistic analysis done on the ways feedlots are handled in order to prevent methane emissions.

Raul Tovar asked what her opinion was on current emissions compared to the 2005 emissions inventory, and how often in her opinion, inventories should be done.

Dzoada Tejeda said the recommendation was for inventories to be done every 2 years.

Reyes Romero mentioned they had done an ozone study for ozone at the Imperial Valley, and that after going over Mexicali's inventory, what they had determined was that as far as nitrogen oxides go, transport and impact in Mexicali and Imperial are big, and this is due to power plants in the region.

Dzoada Tejeda said that new alternatives, such as relocating those power plants should be implemented in order to mitigate the problem. She also said that in order to do this, regulations needed to be adjusted for industries that produce stack emissions.

Reyes Romero mentioned that when these plants were recently installed, the ecological movement in Mexicali was starting. He also mentioned that these plants produce electric power mainly for the U.S. He said that the only thing that was accomplished back then through this movement, was that export produced energy had to be controlled, but this did not applied for the energy produced for Mexicali.

Margarito Quintero added that the ecological movement took place in Mexicali as well as in Imperial. He also said he wanted to mention they had done a brief calculation on the total amount of pollutants taking into account the 2005 and 2014 inventories, and that it showed an increase of about 30% on pollutants at a global level.

Reyes Romero asked if for every measure there was a responsible party and a deadline to be implemented.

Dzoada Tejeda indicated that the term was for ten years with annual evaluations, and that the core committee would be meeting with representatives from the different agencies, which will be in charge of a measure so they can coordinate in order for the measure to be implemented.

Reyes Romero asked if this new program replaces the PROAIRE, or if it only compliments it.

Dzoada Tejeda said the new program is a compliment for each PROAIRE.

Luis Flores said he wanted to make clear that the vehicle emissions as of January 5th, 2010, stopped being the responsibility of the municipality to become the state's responsibility. He also mentioned that agricultural burnings were also the state's responsibility as established by the General Law for Comprehensive Waste Prevention and Management. He mentioned that in the case of livestock activities, it was important that in addition to the agencies in México, which are already in charge of controlling them, they could have a program to clearly define the activities which the state will be in charge of controlling.

Dzoada Tejeda said that the smog check program is indeed in charge of the state. She also mentioned that she agreed on pointing out the livestock activities to be controlled by the municipality because at this point the program was somewhat ambiguous regarding that issue.

V. Border 2020 Projects and Updates; Jeremy Bauer / USEPA

Jeremy Bauer said he was going to have sent through Belen Leon the list of projects awarded for Border 2020 to share with this group. He said that one of the projects is a study at the Mariposa port of entry in Nogales, which is going to observe a pilot project with inspections done jointly by the U.S. and Mexican Customs. He mentioned this project will quantify the air quality and public health benefits of that pilot project. He also mentioned that part of this study will include a survey to about 300 truck drivers in order to look at the age of the trucks, the mileage, and the type of fuel they use, and that the study will be going on for the next 12 months. He said another project with the University of Washington was going to start soon. He said through this project they will be installing 6 monitors in Tijuana and that they were going to have their first meeting for the purpose of this project, soon. He asked if anyone could provide him with a little more details on the new air quality index in Mexico.

An Attendee explained that they had worked on it 2 years ago, and that at the moment it was under public consultation, which would go on for the rest of the year. He said it was probably going to be published in the year 2019.

VI. Updates from Federal, State, and Local Governments

Salton Sea Mitigation Project; Reyes Romero / Air Pollution Control District

Reyes Romero He said that he wanted to give an update on the Mitigation of Exposed Playas at the Salton Sea project. He explained that as the exposed playa has the potential of becoming a big source of fugitive dust, especially after year 2017, when the mitigation water stopped going into the Salton Sea accelerating the Playa exposure. He said that through an EPA grant, the Air Pollution Control District will assess innovative dust best available control measures in order to mitigate the dust on the exposed playa. He said the goal of this project is to allow the land owners in the area to propose those control measures. Once the land owners present their proposals to the District, the district will evaluate them to then submit them to the USEPA as a backup. He also mentioned that the Air Pollution Control District is currently reviewing rule 804, which pertains to open areas and regulates emissions on any

exposed playas, including the Salton Sea. He said this rule was adapted on November 20th, 2005, and it was reviewed on 2016 to allow the development of innovative dust control measures specifically for the Salton Sea, but there had been some disagreements with the EPA so they need to review it once again in order to get it approved by the EPA, and that is what this project is about. He said they were going to be working in conjunction with the state, CARB, and the USEPA. He said that in addition to that, they were also currently working on developing their PM 10 State Implementation Plan, on which they are including a whole chapter on mitigation of fugitive dust from the Salton Sea, thus addressing the impact.

General Project Updates

Fernando Amador said they were continuing with their study in Mexicali for PM 2.5 monitoring, and that they are working with EPA to try to extend it. He also said he would like to commit to have someone from CARB to present the results from this study. He also mentioned that this past holiday season the PM 2.5 values at the Calexico station were extremely high.

Margarito Quintero said he had noticed the same thing in Mexicali, and he also mentioned that this had been in part because of the meteorological conditions, which were different a year ago. He also mentioned that because of this, the Mexicali Core Committee was working at an accelerated pace on coming up with an emergency plan, which they hoped to have finished before the end of the year. He also said they were working on regulating agricultural waste burning.

VII. Wrap Up/ Date of Next Meeting

Belen Leon said the next meeting was programmed for Thursday May 3rd.

Reyes Romero thanked everyone for attending the meeting.

Meeting adjourned